CULTIVATING A SENSE OF BELONGING AT EOP:
AN EXPLORATORY STUDY OF ‘CULTURAL HUMILITY’

Ethan Chang & Priscilla Sung
University of California, Santa Cruz
March 6, 2018

Student Success & Evaluation Research Center (SSERC)
Institutional Research, Assessment, & Policy Studies (IRAPS)
Chancellor’s Graduate Internship Program (CGIP)
Can you think of at least one staff or faculty member at your college who really “had your back”? What did this staff or faculty member do that made you feel this way?

I felt a strong connection to a specific group at my undergraduate university.

THINKING BACK TO COLLEGE…

SENSE OF BELONGING

CULTURAL HUMILITY

(Baumeister & Leary, 1995)

(Tervalon & Murray-García, 1998)
1. What theories and practices inform EOP advisers’ daily work with historically underserved students?
1. What theories and practices inform EOP advisers’ daily work with historically underserved students?

2. What is the relationship between these practices and EOP students’ sense of belonging?
RESEARCH QUESTIONS

1. What theories and practices inform EOP advisers’ daily work with historically underserved students?

2. What is the relationship between these practices and EOP students’ sense of belonging?

3. In what ways do EOP advising, programs, and events cultivate EOP students’ sense of belonging?
PROJECT OVERVIEW

1. Interviews & Observations
   Fall 2016

2. Disseminate Student Survey
   Winter 2017

3. Analyze Survey Data
   Spring 2017

4. Produce Final Report
   Spring 2017

5. Re-analyze Data
   Fall 2017

6. Report Briefing
   Today
PARTICIPANTS

EOP advisers  
(n = 10)

30% Women
90% First generation
50% Hispanic/Latinx
0% Asian American
0% White, non-Hispanic
50% African-American/Black

EOP students  
(n = 773)

74% Women
81% First generation
14% Transfer students
56% Hispanic/Latinx
22% Asian American
11% White, non-Hispanic
8% African-American/Black
RESEARCH QUESTIONS

1. What theories and practices inform EOP advisers’ daily work with historically underserved students?
QUALITATIVE FINDINGS  
(n = 10)

- **Empathizing & Disclosing Shared Experiences of Marginalization**
- **Developing Students’ Agency and Self-Belief**
- ‘Intruding’ as a Means of Affirming
- **Holistic Listening**
Qualitative Findings (n = 10)

- Empathizing & disclosing shared experiences of marginalization
- Developing students’ agency and self-belief
- ‘Intrudin’g as a means of affirming
- Holistic listening

I let students know that I’m not just an EOP advisor who has never experienced this.
Qualitative Findings \((n = 10)\)

- **Empathizing & Disclosing Shared Experiences of Marginalization**

- **Developing Students’ Agency and Self-Belief**

- **‘Intruding’ as a Means of Affirming**

- **Holistic Listening**

I think it’s really important to teach students to advocate for themselves because once you do graduate… you’re left on your own and it’s a sink or swim kind of thing. As a counselor, trying to instill that… being an advocate for themselves and being persistent and providing that support is crucial.
QUALITATIVE FINDINGS (n = 10)

- **Empathizing & Disclosing Shared Experiences of Marginalization**

- **Developing Students’ Agency and Self-Belief**

- **‘Intruding’ as a Means of Affirming**

- **Holistic Listening**

---

I mean we are very intrusive just by texting students. It’s like we care too much so we’re always there. Again, the student is away from their home so we’re like a second family for these students.
A lot of them start talking about class and then I stop them and say, ‘How are you doing?’ I try to take a step back to really check in with the person and see where they are… I feel like it’s important to know where someone is before you start talking about everything else going on in their life.
CULTURAL HUMILITY

Melanie Tervalon, MD, MPH
Jann Murray-García, MD, MPH
CULTURAL HUMILITY  
(Tervalon & Murray-García, 1998)

“My EOP adviser…”

…empathizes with the challenges I experience.
…listens to what I have to say.

“Lifelong commitment to self-evaluation and self-critique”
My EOP adviser…

…empathizes with the challenges I experience.
…listens to what I have to say.
…and I work together as a team.
…encourages me to speak freely.
…encourages my growth as a person.
…helps me to be my own advocate.
My EOP adviser…

…empathizes with the challenges I experience.
…listens to what I have to say.
…and I work together as a team.
…encourages me to speak freely.
…encourages my growth as a person.
…helps me to be my own advocate.
…assures me that I belong in college.
…is concerned about my overall development as a student.
CULTURAL HUMILITY
(Tervalon & Murray-García, 1998)

“Lifelong commitment to self-evaluation and self-critique”

“Redressing power imbalances between patients and physicians”

“Developing mutually beneficial and advocacy partnerships”

My EOP adviser...

...empathizes with the challenges I experience.
...listens to what I have to say.
...and I work together as a team.
...encourages me to speak freely.
...encourages my growth as a person.
...helps me to be my own advocate.
...assures me that I belong in college.
...is concerned about my overall development as a student.

(Chang, 2017)
RESEARCH QUESTIONS

1. What theories and practices inform EOP advisers’ daily work with historically underserved students?

2. What is the relationship between these practices and EOP students’ sense of belonging?

3. In what ways are EOP advising, programs, and events cultivating EOP students’ sense of belonging?
### Do EOP students feel that they belong at EOP?

(Anderson-Butcher & Conroy, 2002)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opinion</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neither agree nor disagree</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**65% feel that they belong at EOP**

$n = 678$
Do EOP advisers practice **cultural humility** in 1-on-1 counseling sessions? (Chang, 2017)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neither agree nor disagree</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

82% agree that EOP advisers practice cultural humility

n = 310
Do students who experience cultural humility in 1-on-1 sessions feel a stronger sense of belonging?

The more that students experience cultural humility from EOP advisers, the stronger their sense of belonging.
RESEARCH QUESTIONS

1. What theories and practices inform EOP advisers’ daily work with historically underserved students?

2. What is the relationship between these practices and EOP students’ sense of belonging with EOP?

3. In what ways do EOP advising, programs, and events cultivate EOP students’ sense of belonging?
In what ways do EOP advising, programs, and events cultivate students’ sense of belonging?
CULTIVATING A SENSE OF BELONGING AT EOP

In what ways do EOP advising, programs, and events cultivate students’ sense of belonging?

I-ON-I COUNSELING

Programs

Events

How many EOP advising sessions have you attended?
In what ways do EOP advising, programs, and events cultivate students’ sense of belonging?

**I-ON-I COUNSELING**

- Single “touch point”
- Provision of educational resources

**PROGRAMS**

- A few "touch points"
- Group activities
- Optional 1:1 advising

**EVENTS**

- Multiple “touch points”
- Intensive cohort programs
- Multiple 1:1 advising sessions.
In what ways do **EOP advising, programs, and events** cultivate students’ sense of belonging?

- **I-ON-I COUNSELING**
- **PROGRAMS**
- **EVENTS**

**How many EOP events have you attended?**
In what ways do EOP advising, programs, and events cultivate students’ sense of belonging?
In what ways do EOP advising, programs, and events cultivate students’ sense of belonging?

“I belong at EOP.”

The more advising, programs, and events that EOP students are involved in, the stronger their sense of belonging.
“EOP is like a beacon for me. I can't believe how there's a resource at the university that was created specifically to assist students like me who are floating and lost and didn’t have successful role models to look up to.”

“Without the physical, emotional, and financial support given to me by EOP, I would not be graduating this June.”

“EOP is a big family. It’s always nice to have a group that is able to support you and motivate you to succeed. I have received help that has not only allowed me to continue my years at this university, but it has taught me that I do in fact belong here.”
FINDINGS & IMPLICATIONS

1. What theories and practices inform EOP advisers’ daily work with historically underserved students?

2. What is the relationship between these practices and EOP students’ sense of belonging?

3. In what ways do EOP advisers, programs, and events cultivate EOP students’ sense of belonging?
1. What theories and practices inform EOP advisers’ daily work with historically underserved students?

- Empathizing & Disclosing
  Shared Experiences of Marginalization
- Developing Students’ Agency and Self-Belief
- Intruding as a Means of Affirming
- Holistic Listening

How might we learn from and work with other practitioners who are tasked with serving the needs of a diverse student body?
2. What is the relationship between these practices and EOP students’ sense of belonging?

What other advising practices might help students feel supported, connected, and motivated to succeed?

The more that students experience cultural humility, the stronger their sense of belonging.

“I belong at EOP”
**FINDINGS & IMPLICATIONS**

3. In what ways do EOP **advisers**, **programs**, and **events** cultivate EOP students’ **sense of belonging**?

The higher students’ level of engagement, the stronger their sense of belonging. "I belong at EOP."

How can these findings inform our programs and practices, moving forward?
LIMITATIONS & FUTURE DIRECTIONS

**LIMITATIONS**

- Relied primarily on survey data to understand student perspectives
- Program-specific study
- Who are the students who are NOT engaged? 20%

**FUTURE DIRECTIONS**

- In-depth interview study, focus groups, observations.
- Exploration of practices at other student success units
- Strategic oversampling of under-engaged EOP students
THANK YOU!

- EOP leadership and staff
- Sam Foster, Rebecca London, & Amy Hyler-Essig (SSERC)
- Anna Sher (IRAPS)
WHOLE GROUP DISCUSSION

Questions or comments?

Moving forward...

1. How might we learn from and work with other practitioners who are tasked with serving the needs of a diverse student body?
2. What other advising practices might help students feel supported, connected, and motivated to succeed?
3. How can these findings inform our programs and practices moving forward?